EPA REGION III



ËPA

From: Deane H. Bartlett (3RC20)

Senior Assistant Regional Counsel U. S. Environmental Protection Agency Region III 1650 Arch Street Philadelphia, PA 19103-2029 Tel.: (215) 814-2776 Fax: (215) 814-2603

To: Einko Dun, Cleak of the EAB at FAX No: <u>202</u> (233-0121 Date: <u>4/11/05</u> Number of pages (including cover): <u>7</u> Subject: <u>Response to WASA Motion For leconscionation</u> Appeal NOS. 05-22, 07-10, 07-11 and 07-12

This facsimile contains privileged and confidential information intended only for the use of the addressee(s) named above. If you are not the intended recipient of this facsimile transmission, or the employee or agent responsible for delivering it to the intended recipient, you are hereby notified that any dissemination or copying of this facsimile is strictly prohibited. If you have received this facsimile in error, please immediately notify the sender at the above phone number and return the original facsimile to the above address by mail.

3

العديد. العام ال

୍

APPEALS BOARD



UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY REGION III 1650 Arch Street Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19103-2029

April 11, 2008

Via Telefax and Federal Express

Ms. Eurika Durr Clerk of the Board, Environmental Appeals Board U.S. Environmental Protection Agency 1341 G Street N.W., Sixth Floor Washington, DC 20005

Re: Response to WASA Motion for Reconsideration Permit Number: DC 0021199 EAB Appeals Nos. 05-02, 07-10, 07-11 and 07-12

EPA

Dear Ms. Durr:

Enclosed please the original and five copies of the above-referenced document, which was filed via telefax today and which I am also serving on the other parties in these matters.

Please contact me at 215-814-2776 if you have any questions.

Thank you for your attention to this matter.

Sincerely,

Deane H. Bartlett Senior Assistant Regional Counsel.

Enclosure

cc: regular mail (with enclosure): David Baron, Esquire - EarthJustice Legal Defense Fund David Evans, Esquire - McGuireWoods LLP John Mueller, Esquire - Chesapeake Bay Foundation F. Paul Calamita, Esquire - Aqualaw

0

Printed on 100% recycled/recyclable paper with 100% post-consumer fiber and process chlorine free. Customer Service Hotline: 1-800-438-2474

APR-11-2008 17:12

EPA

P.03/07

BEFORE THE ENVIRONMENTAL APPEALS BOARD U.S. ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY WASHINGTON, D.C.

In re:

Blue Plains Wastewater Treatment Plant

NPDES Permit No. DC 0021199

NPDES Appeal Nos. 05-02 07-10, 07-11 and 07-12

REGION III RESPONSE TO DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA WATER AND SEWER AUTHORITY'S MOTION FOR RECONSIDERATION

The United States Environmental Protection Agency Region III (Region) hereby responds to the April 1, 2008 District of Columbia Water and Sewer Authority (WASA) Motion for Reconsideration of the Environmental Appeals Board (Board) March 19, 2008 Order denying WASA's petition for review of the Region's decision to include a total nitrogen limit in the April 5, 2007 modified National Pollutant Discharge Elimination System (NPDES) permit for WASA's Blue Plains facility. WASA has asked the Board to reconsider that portion of the Order rejecting WASA's challenge to the total nitrogen limit based on deficiencies in the allocation process.

Under 40 C.F.R. § 124.19(g), motions for reconsideration "must set forth the matters claimed to have been erroneously decided and the nature of the alleged errors." Reconsideration is generally reserved for cases in which the Board is shown to have made a

1

demonstrable error, such as a mistake of law or fact. See In re Gary Development Co., RCRA (3008) Appeal No. 96-2, at 2 (EAB, Sept. 18, 1996) (Order Denying Motion for Reconsideration); "The reconsideration process 'should not be regarded as an opportunity to reargue the case in a more convincing fashion. It should only be used to bring to the attention of the [Board] clearly erroneous factual or legal conclusions." EAB Practice Manual at 37-38 (quoting from *In re Town of Ashland Wastewater Treatment Facility*, NPDES Appeal No. 00-15, slip op at 2 (EAB Apr. 9, 2001).

WASA has failed to meet its burden under this high standard. First, WASA has not articulated a legal or factual basis as to why the Board's Decision that it had no jurisdiction to review the underlying allocation was erroneous. The Board correctly understood that the allocation process and the permitting process are separate and distinct. (Order at 44-45). As the Board pointed out, it is the effluent limitation in the permit, and not the underlying allocation of nitrogen, that falls within the Board's jurisdiction to review. Id. at 44.

Similarly, WASA's allegation that the Board's finding that the Region adequately responded to comments concerning the nitrogen limit was erroneous is not correct. As the Board pointed out, "[t]he Region dedicated ten pages of its Response to Comments document to WASA's comments." Order at 47. This includes response to WASA's comment regarding the relative contributions of the Potomac and the Susquehanna rivers. (Response to Comments p. 21-22).

In filing this motion, WASA is simply attempting to reargue this case, which was

2

amply addressed in briefs and at oral argument. WASA has not met the standard for

EPA

establishing a basis for reconsideration. Therefore, the Motion for Reconsideration should be denied.

Respectfully submitted,

William C. Early Regional Counsel

Deane H. Bartlett Senior Assistant Regional Counsel EPA, Region III

OF COUNSEL:

Sylvia Horwitz Office of General Counsel United States Environmental Protection Agency

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that Respondent's Response to WASA's Motion for Reconsideration in Appeal Nos. 07-10, 07-11 and 07-12, was served on this date as set forth below:

A copy was telefaxed and the original and five copies were mailed by Federal Express to:

Ms. Eurika Durr Clerk of the Board, Environmental Appeals Board U.S. Environmental Protection Agency 1341 G. Street, N.W., Sixth Floor Washington, DC 20005

One copy was mailed by first class mail, postage prepaid to counsel for each of the Petitioners:

Chesapeake Bay Foundation:

Amy McDowell, Esquire Jon A. Mueller, Esquire Chesapeake Bay Foundation Philip Merrill Environmental Center 6 Herndon Avenue Annapolis MD 21403

District of Columbia Water and Sewer Authority:

David E. Evans, Esquire McGuireWoods LLP One James Center 901 East Cary Street Richmond, VA 23219-4030 Friends of the Earth and Sierra Club:

Jennifer C. Chavez, Esquire David Baron, Esquire Earthjustice Legal Defense Fund 1625 Massachusetts Ave., NW Suite 702 Washington, DC 20036-2212

NACWA

F. Paul Calamita, Esquire
AquaLaw PLC
6 South 5th Street
Annapolis, MD 21403

Date: $4/11/\delta \Sigma$

Deane H. Bartlett Senior Assistant Regional Counsel Office of Regional Counsel EPA Region III 1650 Arch Street Philadelphia, PA 19103-2029 Telephone:(215) 814-2776 Fax: (215) 814-2603